

Makos Review Lessons 68 - DAF 14A:

A KORBAN FOR EACH ERVAH

1. **Beraisa - R. Yitzchak:** The Torah taught that (all) Arayos are Chayavei Kerisus, and (superfluously) mentions Kares for Bi'ah with a sister; This teaches that it (and all other Chayavei Kerisus) are punishable by Kares, and not by lashes.
2. **Question:** What do Chachamim (R' Akiva & R' Yishmael) learn from this?
3. **Answer #1:** This Kares individualizes the Arayos, like R. Yochanan taught...
4. **R. Yochanan:** If one forgot several Chayavei Kerisus and transgressed them (without remembering in between), he brings a Korban for each one. (Since one verse obligates Kares for all the Arayos ("mi'Kol ha'To'evos ha'Eleh v'Nichresu"), one might have thought that they are all considered one Kares, and only one Korban is brought for many transgressions in one Helam (forgetting)).
5. **Question:** What is R. Yitzchak's source to individualize the Arayos?
6. **Answer:** "V'El Ishah b'Tumas Nidasah" obligates for every woman. (The extra word Ishah)
7. **Objection:** Also Chachamim should learn from "v'El Ishah...".
8. **Answer #2:** (Indeed, they do. Rather,) They learn the Kares for Bi'ah with a sister teaches that if one has Bi'ah with his sister, and the sisters of his father and mother, he is liable for each one.
9. **Objection:** This is obvious! They are different transgressions and different women!
10. **Answer #3:** Rather, it teaches that if one has Bi'ah with his sister, who is also the sister of his father and mother, he is liable (a separate Korban) for each (of the three reasons she is forbidden to him).
11. **Question:** How can his sister be the sister of his parents?
12. **Answer:** His father was a Rasha. (Zimri fathered Rachel and Leah from his mother, and he fathered Doson from Rachel. Leah is Doson's (paternal) sister, and she is the maternal sister of his parents.)
13. **Question:** What is R. Yitzchak's source for this?
14. **Answer #1:** He learns from a Kal va'Chomer; as we see from....
15. **Beraisa - R. Akiva Question:** If one has Bi'ah with his sister, who is also the sister of his father and mother, is he is liable once, or for each transgression?
16. **Answer - Raban Gamliel and R. Yehoshua:** We heard only the following. If one has Bi'ah with five Nidos in one Helem, he is liable for each woman. All the more so, in your case he is liable for each!
17. If he is liable for each when they are the same transgression (Nidah), and all the more so for different Arayos (sister, paternal aunt, maternal aunt)!
18. **Chachamim** reject this Kal va'Chomer. He is liable for each Nidah because they are different women!
19. **Objection:** R. Yitzchak must admit that the Kal va'Chomer is refuted!