

Review of Makos Lesson 14 - Daf 4A:

(e)**Question (Rav Kahana):** Why is it different than dye water?

1.(**Mishnah - R. Yosi**): If three Lugin of dye water fell into a Mikveh, they disqualify it.

(f)**Answer (Rava):** Since it is called dye **water**, the law of Mayim She'uvim applies. In Rav Yehudah's case, it is called mixed (diluted) wine, so the law of Mayim She'uvim does not apply.

(g)**Question (R. Chiya's Beraisa):** A case (like Rav discusses) occurred, and they disqualified the Mikveh.

Daf 4A:

(a)**Answer (Rava):** Rav holds like R. Yochanan ben Nuri, and R. Chiya's Beraisa holds like Chachamim. As we see in the following

1.(**Mishnah**): If a Kortov of wine fell into water, and the volume of the mixture is now three Lugin, and it looks like wine, the mixture does not disqualify a Mikveh. (This is because there are not three full Lugin of water in the mixture, but if there were, it would disqualify the Mikveh);

2.Similarly, if a Kortov of milk fell into water, and there are three Lugin in the mixture, and it looks like water, the mixture does not disqualify a Mikveh;

3.R. Yochanan ben Nuri says, it all depends on the appearance (if it looks like water, it disqualifies a Mikveh). And even if there was three Lugin of water it will not disqualify if it looks like wine.

(b)**Question:** Rav Papa was unsure about this!

1.**Question (Rav Papa):** Did Rav's text of the first clause of the Mishnah say that the volume of the mixture is three Lugin, but if there were three Lugin of water alone, Chachamim disqualify the Mikveh?

i.If so, Rav holds like R. Yochanan ben Nuri.

2.Or, did Rav's text say that the volume of the water is three Lugin, and R. Yochanan ben Nuri argues only in the second clause?

i.If so, Rav's law is like everyone.

(c)**Answer:** Rav Papa was unsure. Rava was sure (that Rav holds like R. Yochanan ben Nuri).

(d)**Rav Yosef:** I (was a Talmid of Rav, yet I) never heard this teaching!

(e)**Abaye:** You yourself taught us that Rav's text says that there are three Lugin of water, and Rav's law is like everyone! (Rav Yosef forgot his learning when he fell sick.)

Mixtures of water and some other liquid in which the total is at least three lugin					
		three lugin water		less than three lugin water	
		not colored	colored	not colored	colored
First version of the Mishnah	Tanna Kamma	invalidates	invalidates	does not invalidate	does not invalidate
	R' Yochanan ben Nuri	invalidates	does not invalidate	invalidates	does not invalidate
Second version of the Mishnah	Tanna Kamma	invalidates	does not invalidate	does not invalidate	does not invalidate
	R' Yochanan ben Nuri	invalidates	does not invalidate	invalidates	does not invalidate

Rav rules that even a full three *lugin* of water *do not invalidate* if they are colored. According to the first reading, Rav follows the view of R' Yochanan ben Nuri; according to the second reading, however, Rav is consistent with both the Tanna Kamma and R' Yochanan ben Nuri.

Rava states that Rav had the first reading; Rav Yosef states that Rav had the second; Rav Pappa is in doubt.