

Review of Makos Lesson 20 - Daf 5A:

2)IN WHAT CASES DO WITNESSES BECOME ZOMEMIM?

(a)(**Mishnah**): Edim become Zomemim only if the Mezimim contradict what the first ones implicitly said about themselves (i.e. that they were at the scene of what they testified about).

1.If two witnesses testified that Ploni killed Shimon, and other witnesses (David and Moshe) say 'that is impossible. That day, Ploni (or Shimon) was with us somewhere else!', the first witnesses are not Zomemim;

2.However, if David and Moshe say 'How can you testify about this? That day, you were with us in a different place', the first witnesses are Zomemim. They are killed based on the testimony of David and Moshe.

(b)If more witnesses testified, and they were Huzam, and more witnesses testified, and they were Huzam, all the Zomemim are killed; (Rashi - each new pair testified about Ploni, and David and Moshe were Mezim them.)

(c)R. Yehudah says, this is a conspiracy (to be Mezim anyone who will testify)! Only the first witnesses are killed (this will be explained).

(d)(**Gemara**) **Question**: What is the source of the first law of the Mishnah?

(e)**Answer #1 (Rav Ada)**: "V'Hinei Ed Sheker ha'Ed Sheker Onah" - they must establish the witnesses themselves to be false (i.e. what they implicitly said about themselves).

(f)**Answer #2 (Tana d'Vei R. Yishmael)**: "La'anos Bo Sarah" - the witnesses themselves must be Husru (removed, i.e. we learn that they were not there).

(g)(**Rava**): If two witnesses said 'Ploni killed someone to the east of the building', and others said '(at that time,) you were with us to the west of the building', we check;

1.If someone to the west can see what is happening to the east, they are not Zomemim. If not, they are Zomemim.

(h)**Question**: This is obvious!

(i)**Answer**: One might have thought that we suspect that the witnesses have better eyesight than normal people. The Mishnah teaches that this is not so.

(j)(**Rava**): If two witnesses said 'Sunday morning in Sura, Ploni killed someone', and others said 'Sunday afternoon, you were with us in Neharde'a', we check:

1.If someone can travel from Sura to Neharde'a in that amount of time, they are not Zomemim. If not, they are Zomemim.

(k)**Question**: This is obvious!

(l)**Answer**: One might have thought that we suspect that the witnesses found camels that run much faster than normal. The Mishnah teaches that this is not so.

(